## **EXHIBIT 4**

Page 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT IN THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK Case No. 22-cv-10336 (AT)(GWG)

[rel. 20-cv-3389]

Local 2507, UNIFORMED EMTs,
PARAMEDICS & FIRE INSPECTORS,
individually and on behalf of its
current and former members; et al.,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

CITY OF NEW YORK on behalf of the Fire Department of the City of New York,

Defendant.

\_\_\_\_\_

VIDEO CONFERENCE DEPOSITION OF
ROBERT WILLIAM ALEXANDER
30(b)(6) AND FACT WITNESS

May 16th, 2023 Via Video Conference 1:00 p.m. - 5:14 p.m.

Reported by:
MARCIA L. ALF, R.P.R.
Notary Public
Job SY7237

Page 116

- 1 that's correct.
- 2 BY MS. KURLAND:
- 3 Q. When you say by exam by exam basis, does that
- 4 mean that the agency has to tell you each time, okay,
- 5 we'd like to link these two titles up again?
- 6 A. That's correct.
- 7 Q. Do they have to give you a proposal or an
- 8 explanation for why they think those titles are
- 9 related enough such that one can promote to the other?
- 10 MS. MINICUCCI: Objection. You can answer.
- 11 THE WITNESS: They do not. Because in the
- 12 situations of firefighter, they are -- they are
- titles used exclusively by the FDNY. If there
- were to be titles outside of their purview, then
- 15 yes, we would have to look at some rhyme or
- reason for the proposal. Because that could be
- 17 poaching from other agency's employees.
- 18 BY MS. KURLAND:
- 19 Q. For example, let's use the PAA title that you
- 20 talked about earlier.
- 21 If PAAs were not designated to be in the line
- 22 of promotion already into administrative managers,
- 23 which I think they are, let's assume for this
- 24 hypothetical that they weren't already determined to
- 25 be in the line of promotion, and the FDNY came to you